

Presentation to the Public Forum

"A LIVING WAGE"

Hosted by the Parliamentary Joint Select Committee

Held on Thursday April 20<sup>th</sup> 2017

At St. Paul's Centennial Church Hall

This presentation was prepared by Chris Furbert JP, BIU President



# BIU LIVING WAGE PRESENTATION TO THE PUBLIC FORUM HOSTED BY THE PARLIAMENTARY JOINT SELECT COMMITTEE

#### HELD THURSDAY APRIL $20^{TH}$ 2017 AT ST. PAUL'S CENTENNIAL CHURCH HALL

The Bermuda Industrial Union is delighted to make a presentation to this Public Forum hosted by the Parliamentary Joint Select Committee on a Living Wage for Bermuda. The average Bermudian today is not able to afford a reasonable quality of life based on their earned income that has been declining for several years, that has impacted their disposal income and their purchasing power. The inequality in wage earnings appears to be a problem in most developing Countries, because several of them are also having a conversation about a Living Wage.

#### SO WHAT IS A LIVING WAGE?

A Living Wage is considered a Human Right by the International Community of Nations.

A Living Wage should be sufficient to support a basic standard of living that is considered decent for a specific time and place. Several descriptions for developing countries mentioned basic needs. The acceptable basic standard, however, increases with economic development.

A Living standard supported by a Living Wage should provide for more than just the necessities of life (food, shelter and clothing). Some descriptions, for example, refer to health care, education, transportation and recreation; other refers to the need for savings or some discretionary income.

A Living Wage is a family concept. A worker should be able to support a family on a Living Wage.

Research has showed that there are many countries around the world that are exploring ALL aspects of a Living Wage (Livable Wage). Some of the "Living Wage Campaigns have already delivered tangible improvements for thousands of low—paid workers. Yet the organizations that have made the voluntary decision to implement a living wage remain few in number and are confined to a relatively narrow range sectors. Recent reductions in tax credits mean that wage growth will be more crucial than ever in maintaining the living standards of low-to-middle income households. In this context it is right that, where possible, employers pay their low-paid staff a living wage". (taken from a report produced by Institute for Public Policy Research IPPR)

Popes agree that a Living Wage should be sufficient for a single earner in the family to be able to support his family. Pope John Paul 11 says " a family wage – that is a single salary given to head of the family for his work, sufficient for needs of the family without the other spouse having to take up gainful employment outside the home". The Catholic Church supports what it considers appropriate gender roles, where husbands go out to work to earn income and wives stay home to take care of the home and children.

"A living wage is not transfer of wealth from the rich to the poor, it's an investment every community needs to empower dignity and the poor will benefit — it will raise their opportunity and raise their potential." (Lord Hastings RG article May 20, 2016)

"We have to change the paradigm. We also have to change the view that the money isn't available. The one per cent now control more wealth that the 99 per cent put together." (Lord Hastings RG article May 20, 2016)

Franklin Roosevelt the 37<sup>th</sup> President of the United States of America (USA) said "No business which depends for existence on paying less than living wages to its workers has any right to continue in this country. By Living wages I mean more than a bare subsistence level – I mean the wages of decent living".

It should be very obvious that the quality of life in Bermuda for the middle class and low class has been held at a complete disadvantage when it comes to the wages/salaries that they earned when compared to that of some whites and others. Therefore the disparity in wages between Blacks and White & others needs to be addressed.

Now that we are having the discussion concerning a Living Wage for Bermuda I certainly hope that ALL stakeholders will participate in the process. Therefore I look forward to making sure that Bermuda as a country will address the imbalance in the wage earnings between Blacks, Whites and Others.

## The Household Expenditure Survey Reports - 1974, 1982, 1993, 2004 & 2013

	19	74	19	82	199	93	200	04	20	13
Food & non-alcoholic beverages	51.54	23.93%	92.06	17.14%	141.83	14.58%	210.61	13.69%	229.33	12.69%
Alcoholic drink & tobacco	5.77	2.68%	12.95	2.41%	21.48	2.21%	29.19	1.90%	39.37	2.18%
Clothing & footwear	13.24	6.15%	31.29	5.83%	47.40	4.87%	56.13	3.65%	49.98	2.77%
Housing	44.35	20.59%	121.39	22.61%	269.23	27.67%	511.86	33.28%	519.57	28.75%
Fuel & power	9.64	4.48%	23.34	4.35%	32.54	3.34%	45.16	2.94%	75.21	4.16%
Household goods & services	28.11	13.05%	81.4	15.16%	161.94	16.64%	212.84	13.84%	195.40	10.81%
Transportation	16.54	7.68%	50.24	9.36%	71.27	7.32%	123.75	8.05%	116.82	6.46%
Education	5.40	2.51%	16.56	3.08%	37.46	3.85%	64.14	4.17%	85.63	4.74%
Foreign travel	12.72	5.91%	37.25	6.94%	58.11	5.97%	83.58	5.43%	97.82	5.41%
Medical, health & personal care	12.92	6.00%	33.94	6.32%	73.59	7.56%	133.06	8.65%	197.87	10.95%
Entertainment & recreattion & Misc.	15.12	7.02%	36.56	6.81%	58.25	5.99%	67.61	4.40%	200.05	11.07%
Total Consumption	215.35	100.00%	536.98	100.00%	973.10	100.00%	1,537.93	100.00%	1,807.05	100.00%
Increase in Consumption Cost			321.63		436.12		564.83		269.12	
Average increase per week for each period			35.74		39.65	,	51.35		29.90	
					¥.					

Summary of Household expenditure and the overall	% increase from	1974 to 2013
--	-----------------	--------------

*	1974			2013		% Increase
Food & non-alcoholic Bev.	\$ 51.54	23.93%	\$	229.33	12.69%	345%
Alcoholic drink & tobacco	\$ 5.77	2.68%	\$	39.37	2.18%	580%
Clothing & footwear	\$ 13.24	6.15%	\$	49.98	2.77%	275%
Housing	\$ 44.35	20.59%	\$	519.57	28.75%	1070%
Fuel & power	\$ 9.64	4.48%	\$	75.21	4.16%	675%
Household goods & services	\$ 28.11	13.05%	\$	195.40	10.81%	595%
Transportation	\$ 16.54	7.68%	\$	116.82	6.46%	605%
Education	\$ 5.40	2.51%	\$	85.63	4.74%	1485%
Foreign travel	\$ 12.72	5.91%	\$	97.82	5.41%	670%
Medical, health & personal care	\$ 12.92	6.00%	\$	197.87	10.95%	1430%
Entertainment & recreattion & Misc.	\$ 15.12	7.02%	\$	200.05	11.07%	1225%
* E						*
Total Consumption	\$ 215.35	100.00%	\$	1,807.05	100.00%	
			^	4 504 50		
	. 20		\$	1,591.70		740%

#### THERE ARE 4 HOUSEHOLD EXPENDITURE ITEMS THAT HAVE INCREASED BY MORE THAN 1000% BETWEEN 1974 TO 2013

- 1. Housing in 1974 was \$44.35 and in 2013 it was \$519.57 an increase of \$475.22 or 1.070%
- 2. Education in 1974 was \$5.40 and in 2013 it was \$85.63 an increase of \$80.23 or 1,485%
- 3. Medical, Health & Personal Care in 1974 was \$12.92 and in 2013 it was \$197.87 an increase of \$184.95 or 1,430%
- 4. Entertainment & Recreational & Misc. in 1974 was \$15.12 and in 2013 it was \$200.05 an increase of \$184.95 or 1,225%

#### The Household Expenditure Survey Reports - 1974, 1982, 1993, 2004 & 2013 YEAR Public Works (W & E) Division 1974 1993 1982 2004 2013 **Total Consumption** \$ 536.98 \$ 215.35 973.10 1,537.93 1.807.05 Increase in consumption over the years 321.63 \$ 436.12 \$ 564.83 269.12 **Employee 1** \$ 298.00 \$ 226.00 700.00 1,015.00 1,275.00 Increase in wages 72.00 402.00 \$ \$ 315.00 260.00 Difference in consumption increases (249.63) \$ (34.12) \$ (249.83)\$ (9.12)Difference in Disposal income per week \$ 10.65 (238.98) \$ (273.10)\$ (522.93)\$ (532.05)Difference in Disposal income per month \$ (1,035.58)\$ 46.15 (1,183.43) \$ (2,266.03) \$ (2,305.55)**Employee 2** \$ 190.00 254.00 \$ 658.00 \$ 923.00 \$ 1,165.00 Increase in wages 64.00 \$ 404.00 \$ 265.00 \$ 242.00 Difference in consumption increases (257.63)\$ (32.12) \$ (299.83)\$ (27.12)Difference in Disposal income per week \$ (25.35) \$ (282.98) \$ (315.10) \$ (614.93) \$ (642.05)Difference in Disposal income per month (109.85) \$ (1,226.25)\$ (1,365.43)\$ (2.664.70) \$ (2,782.22)Employee 3 \$ \$ 180.00 222.00 \$ 620.00 \$ 880.00 1,115.00 Increase in wages \$ 42.00 \$ 398.00 \$ 260.00 \$ 235.00 Difference in consumption increases (279.63)\$ (38.12) \$ (304.83)\$ (34.12)Difference in Disposal income per week \$ (35.35) \$ (314.98) \$ (353.10)\$ (657.93)\$ (692.05)Difference in Disposal income per month (153.18) \$ (1,364.91)\$ (1,530.10) \$ (2.851.03)(2,998.88)

on-alcoholic Bev.	4			2013	φ	Increase	% Increase	Employee Increase	Difference
c drink & tobacco	\$	51.54	\$	229.33	\$	177.79	345%	464%	119%
	\$	5.77	\$	39.37	\$	33.60	580%	464%	-116%
& footwear	\$	13.24	\$	49.98	\$	36.74	275%	464%	189%
	\$	44.35	\$	519.57	\$	475.22	1070%	464%	-606%
wer	\$	9.64	\$	75.21	\$	65.57	675%	464%	-211%
d goods & services	\$	28.11	\$	195.40	\$	167.29	595%	464%	-131%
tation	\$	16.54	\$	116.82	\$	100.28	605%	464%	-141%
1	\$	5.40	\$	85.63	\$	80.23	1485%	464%	-1021%
ravel	\$	12.72	\$	97.82	\$	85.10	670%	464%	-206%
nealth & personal care	\$	12.92	\$	197.87	\$	184.95	1430%	464%	-966%
ment & recreattion & Misc.	\$	15.12	\$	200.05	\$	184.93	1230%	464%	-766%
nsumption Increases	\$	215.35	\$	1,807.05	\$	1,591.70	740%		
e Wage Increases	\$	226.00	\$	1,275.00	\$	1,049.00	464%		
			Vage Increases \$ 226.00	Vage Increases \$ 226.00 \$	Vage Increases \$ 226.00 \$ 1,275.00	Vage Increases \$ 226.00 \$ 1,275.00 \$	Vage Increases \$ 226.00 \$ 1,275.00 \$ 1,049.00	Vage Increases \$ 226.00 \$ 1,275.00 \$ 1,049.00 464%	Vage Increases \$ 226.00 \$ 1,275.00 \$ 1,049.00 464%

		1974		1982		199	3	2004			2013	
	PUBLIC WORKS/ W&E EMPLOYEE 1	\$ 226.00		\$ 298.00		\$ 700.00		\$ 1,015.00		\$ 1	1,275.00	-
1	Food & non-alcoholic beverages	51.54	23%	92.06	31%	141.83	20%	210.61	21%		229.33	18%
2	Alcoholic drink & tobacco	5.77	3%	12.95	4%	21.48	3%	29.19	3%		39.37	3%
3	Clothing & footwear	13.24	6%	31.29	11%	47.40	7%	56.13	6%		49.98	4%
4	Housing	44.35	20%	121.39	41%	269.23	38%	511.86	50%		519.57	41%
5	Fuel & power	9.64	4%	23.34	8%	32.54	5%	45.16	4%		75.21	6%
6	Household goods & services	28.11	12%	81.4	27%	161.94	23%	212.84	21%		195.40	15%
7	Transportation	16.54	7%	50.24	17%	71.27	10%	123.75	12%		116.82	9%
8	Education	5.40	2%	16.56	6%	37.46	5%	64.14	6%		85.63	7%
9	Foreign travel	12.72	6%	37.25	13%	58.11	8%	83.58	8%		97.82	8%
10	Medical, health & personal care	12.92	6%	33.94	11%	73.59	11%	133.06	13%		197.87	16%
11	Entertainment & recreattion & Misc.	15.12	7%	36.56	12%	58.25	8%	67.61	7%		200.05	16%
	Total Consumption	\$ 215.35	95%	\$ 536.98	180%	\$ 973.10	139%	\$ 1,537.93	152%	\$ 1	1,807.05	142%
	Difference in wage, compared to househ/Exp.	\$ 10.65	5%	\$ (238.98)	-80%	\$ (273.10)	-39%	\$ (522.93)	-52%	\$	(532.05)	-42%
	Disposal income % after expenditure of (2 persons)	\$ 170.00	105%	\$ 260.00	20%	\$ 640.00	61%	\$ 940.00	48%	\$ 1	1,100,00	58%

#### The Household Expenditure Survey Reports - 1974, 1982, 1993, 2004 & 2013

H	197	74	19	82	19	93	20	04	20	13
Food & non-alcoholic beverages	51.54	23.93%	92.06	17.14%	141.83	14.58%	210.61	13.69%	229.33	12.69%
Alcoholic drink & tobacco	5.77	2.68%	12.95	2.41%	21.48	2.21%	29.19	1.90%	39.37	2.18%
Clothing & footwear	13.24	6.15%	31.29	5.83%	47.40	4.87%	56.13	3.65%	49.98	2.77%
Housing	44.35	20.59%	121.39	22.61%	269.23	27.67%	511.86	33.28%	519.57	28.75%
Fuel & power	9.64	4.48%	23.34	4.35%	32.54	3.34%	45.16	2.94%	75.21	4.16%
Household goods & services	28.11	13.05%	81.4	15.16%	161.94	16.64%	212.84	13.84%	195.40	10.81%
Transportation	16.54	7.68%	50.24	9.36%	71.27	7.32%	123.75	8.05%	116.82	6.46%
Education	5.40	2.51%	16.56	3.08%	37.46	3.85%	64.14	4.17%	85.63	4.74%
Foreign travel	12.72	5.91%	37.25	6.94%	58.11	5.97%	83.58	5.43%	97.82	5.41%
Medical, health & personal care	12.92	6.00%	33.94	6.32%	73.59	7.56%	133.06	8.65%	197.87	10.95%
Entertainment & recreattion & Misc.	15.12	7.02%	36.56	6.81%	58.25	5.99%	67.61	4.40%	200.05	11.07%
Total Consumption	215.35	100.00%	536.98	100.00%	973.10	100.00%	1,537.93	100.00%	1,807.05	100.00%
Increase in Consumption Cost	-	-	321.63		436.12		564.83		269.12	
Average increase per week for each period		-	35.74		39.65		51.35		29.90	5
Employee 1 [Public Works or W&E]	220 00		200.00		700.00		1015.00			
Employee I [Fublic Works or W&E]	226.00	1	298.00		700.00		1015.00		1275.00	
Percentage of Wage that goes towards rent	19.6%		40.7%		38.5%		50.4%		40.8%	21.1%
Employee 2	190.00		254.00		658.00		923.00		1165.00	
Percentage of Wage that goes towards rent	23.3%		47.8%		40.9%		55.5%		44.6%	21.3%
Employee 3	180.00		222.00		620.00		880.00		1115.00	
Percentage of Wage that goes towards rent	24.6%		54.7%		43.4%		58.2%		46.6%	22.0%

## A Wage Freeze over the last 5 years has Impacted the Real Value of this Employees Wage

YEAR	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	Total
CPI Increases	1	2.44%	1.75%	2.01%	1.45%	1.44%	9.09%

Per Year	\$ 66,300.00	\$ 67,917.72	\$ 69,106.28	\$ 70,495.32	\$ 71,517.50	\$ 72,547.35	\$ 6,247.35
Total increase per year		\$ 1,617.72	\$ 1,188.56	\$ 1,389.04	\$ 1,022.18	\$ 1,029.85	\$ 6,247.35
Per Week	\$ 1,275.00	\$ 1,306.11	\$ 1,328.97	\$ 1,355.68	\$ 1,375.34	\$ 1,395.14	\$ 120.14
Increase per week		\$ 31.11	\$ 22.86	\$ 26.71	\$ 19.66	\$ 19.80	\$ 120.14

The Real Value of the Em	ploye	es wage ha	s go	ne down du	e to	the wage fr	eez	<b>e</b>	8/19			
Per Year	\$	66,300.00	\$	64,682.28	\$	63,550.24	\$	62,273.12	\$	61,370.40	\$ 60,486.92	\$ (5,813.08)
Total increase per year			\$	(1,617.72)	\$	(1,132.04)	\$	(1,277.12)	\$	(902.72)	\$ (883.48)	\$ (5,813.08)
Per Week	\$	1,275.00	\$	1,243.89	\$	1,222.12	\$	1,197.56	\$	1,180.20	\$ 1,163.21	\$ (111.79)
wage freeze per week			\$	(31.11)	\$	(21.77)	\$	(24.56)	\$	(17.36)	\$ (16.99)	\$ (111.79)

## Table 8 Household Type By Average Weekly Income and Consumption, and Consumption As A Percentage Of Income, 2013 (Page 19 of the 2013 Report)

	1	rage weekly Income	Annual Income	-	Average weekly Consumption	Annual Consumption	Consumption as a Percentage of Income
Total	\$	2,766.96	\$ 143,881.92	\$	1,807.00	\$ 93,964.00	65.3%
Disposal Income and %			\$ 49,917.92				34.7%
One Person	\$	1,578.50	\$ 82,082.00	\$	1,093.39	\$ 56,856.28	69.3%
			\$ 25,225.72				30.7%
One Parent	\$	2,025.91	\$ 105,347.32	\$	1,555.15	\$ 80,867.80	76.8%
			\$ 24,479.52				23.2%
Two Parents	\$	4,330.85	\$ 225,204.20	\$	3,111.08	\$ 161,776.16	71.8%
			\$ 63,428.04				28.2%
Adult Couple	\$	3,518.88	\$ 182,981.76	\$	1,896.58	\$ 98,622.16	53.9%
			\$ 84,359.60				46.1%
Extended Family	\$	2,727.16	\$ 141,812.32	\$	1,727.01	\$ 89,804.52	63.3%
			\$ 52,007.80				36.7%
Unrelated Persons	\$	2,501.52	\$ 130,079.04	\$	2,213.47	\$ 115,100.44	88.5%
			\$ 14,978.60				11.5%

# Table A.5 Summary of Weekly Income and Total Weekly Expenditure by Race and Sex (Page 27 of the 2013 Report)

	rage weekly Income		Annual Income	Average weekly Consumption	Annual Consumption	Consumption as a Percentage of Income
Total	\$ 2,766.96	\$	143,881.92	\$ 1,807.00	\$ 93,964.00	65.3%
Disposal Income and %		\$	49,917.92			34.7%
Both Sexes Black	\$ 2,120.00	\$ <b>\$</b>	110,240.00 <b>26,988.00</b>	\$ 1,601.00	\$ 83,252.00	75.5% 30.7%
Both Sexes White & Other	\$ 3,596.00	\$ <b>\$</b>	186,992.00 <b>53,924.00</b>	\$ 2,559.00	\$ 133,068.00	71.2% 23.2%

		Wee	ekly House	ehol	ld Incom	e 19	993				
Total Households in sample	746		72		129		276		126	74	69
This information can be found				\$	350	\$	600	\$	1,300	\$ 1,800	\$ 2,400
on page 39 of the 1993			Under	11 6500	-	-00	:-	-57	: <del>-</del>	 -	_
Household Expenditure Report		\$	350	\$	599	\$	1,200	\$	1,799	\$ 2,399	over
Low		\$	_	\$	18,200	\$	31,200	\$	67,600	\$ 93,600	\$ 124,800
High		\$	18,200	\$	31,148	\$	62,400	\$	93,548	\$ 124,748	

Weekly Household Income 2004													
Total Households in sample	762		74		129		257		152		93		67
This information can be found				\$	550	\$	1,000	\$	2,000	\$	3,000	\$	4,000
on page 45 of the 2004			Under		<del>a</del> i		-		1.77				I <del></del>
Household Expenditure Report		\$	550	\$	999	\$	1,999	\$	2,999	\$	3,999		Over
Low		\$	=	\$	28,600	\$	52,000	\$	104,000	\$	156,000	\$	208,000
High		\$	28,600	\$	51,948	\$	103,948	\$	155,948	\$	207,948		

		Wee	kly House	ehol	d Incom	e 20	13			
Total Households in sample	673	T	141		130		133	131	138	
This information can be found				\$	1,093	\$	1,658	\$ 2,378	\$ 3,612	
on page 24 of the 2013			Under		-		-	<u> </u>	-	
Household Expenditure Report		\$	1,092	\$	1,657	\$	2,377	\$ 3,611	\$ -	
.ow		\$	=0	\$	56,836	\$	86,216	\$ 123,656	\$ 187,824	
High		\$	56,784	\$	86,164	\$	123,604	\$ 187,772	\$ 8 <b>-</b>	

## Average weekly household income All Races, Black, White & Other

This information can be found on page 36 of the 1993 Household Expenditure Report		LL RACES 1993	BLACK 1993	WHITE & OTHER 1993		
Average weekly household income	\$	1,263.18	\$ 990.81	\$	1,599.15	
Total expenditure	\$	1,060.58	\$ 838.08	\$	1,313.73	
Difference in income and expenditure	\$	202.60	\$ 152.73	\$	285.42	

This information can be found on page 43 of the 2004		ALL RACES	BLACK	WHITE & OTHER		
Household Expenditure Report		2004	2004		2004	
Average weekly household income	\$	2,042.95	\$ 1,675.71	\$	2,489.18	
increase in household income from 1993	\$	779.77	\$ 684.90	\$	890.03	
Total expenditure	\$	1,681.17	\$ 1,325.57	\$	2,109.02	
increase in total expenditure from 1993	\$	620.59	\$ 487.49	\$	795.29	
Difference in income and expenditure	\$	361.78	\$ 350.14	\$	380.16	
Difference in income and expenditure from 1993	\$	159.18	\$ 197.41	\$	94.74	

This information can be found on page 27 of the 2013 Household Expenditure Report	A	LL RACES 2013	BLACK 2013	WHITE & OTHER 2013		
Average weekly household income	\$	2,776.96	\$ 2,120.42	\$	3,596.75	
increase in household income from 2004	\$	734.01	\$ 444.71	\$	1,107.57	
Total expenditure	\$	2,023.38	\$ 1,601.16	\$	2,559.75	
increase in total expenditure from 2004	\$	342.21	\$ 275.59	\$	450.73	
Difference in income and expenditure	\$	753.58	\$ 519.26	\$	1,037.00	
Difference in income and expenditure from 2004	\$	391.80	\$ 169.12	\$	656.84	